Meeting Notes
Project 2016-02 Modifications to CIP
Standards Drafting Team

December 6-7, 2017 | 8:30 a.m. – 5:00 p.m. Central

ERCOT Offices Austin, TX

Administrative

1. **Review NERC Antitrust Compliance Guidelines and Public Announcement**

   Mat Bunch reviewed the NERC Antitrust Compliance Guidelines and noted that the meeting was public.

2. **Safety briefing**

   Christine Hasha welcomed the CIP standard drafting team (SDT) and observers to ERCOT and reviewed safety protocols.

3. **Introductions, determination of quorum, chairs' remarks**

   Christine Hasha welcomed the group and reviewed the meeting agenda and objectives. The attachments herein contain the attendance for each day.

Agenda Items

1. **Modifications for Virtualization and CIP definitions**

Tobias Whitley (NERC CIP Compliance) reviewed the redacted Remote Access Study that was presented to the team in July 2018. The SDT spent the majority of the time reviewing the [comments received](#) on the informal virtualization posting. Based on industry feedback, the SDT members proposed the following modifications to the Cyber Asset definition:

> *Cyber Assets--Programmable electronic physical or virtual devices, including the hardware, software, and data in those devices. Each virtual machine and host is a distinct device.*

The SDT discussed super electronic security perimeters (super ESPs) and agreed that layer 2 transport between two (geographic) locations should be exempt. In developing exemption language, the SDT noted that it should be able to better define appropriate controls when modifying requirements. It was also suggested that the term, "network" be removed from the current ESP definition. The team agreed that in order to properly address the super ESP issue, the discussion should generally be focused on "what" to protect and not "whom."

Given that many commenters raised concern regarding the term "programmable," the team was polled on whether or not the term should be included in the NERC Glossary definition. Ultimately, only two team members agreed with this approach.

The team continued to review the definition of Electronic Access Control or Monitoring Systems (EACMS). After much discussion, the team was still in agreement with the approach of removing 'monitoring' from the definition. The SDT also briefly discussed the following additional Glossary terms for virtualization for later consideration:

- Virtual Device;
- Physical Device;
- Virtual Machine;
- Physical Machine
- Virtual Host;
- Physical Host.

The SDT will hold conference calls in January 2018 to further explore the best approach for addressing virtualization in the CIP environment.

2. Adjourn

December 6, 2017

Question: Do we need to address "programmable" in the Glossary definition? (Y/N)

Name	Company	Member/ Observer	Straw Vote	Meeting (Y/N)
Christine Hasha	Electric Reliability Council of Texas	Co-Chair	N	Y
David Revill	Georgia System Operations Corporation	Co-Chair	-	N
Steven Brain	Dominion Energy	Member	N	Y
Jay Cribb	Southern Company	Member	N	Y
Jennifer Flandermeyer	Kansas City Power and Light	Member	-	N
Tom Foster	PJM Interconnection	Member	N	Y
Richard Kinas	Orlando Utilities Commission	Member	-	Y
Forrest Krigbaum	Bonneville Power Administration	Member	Y	Y
Philippe Labrosse	Hydro-Quebec TransEnergie	Member	Y	Y
Mark Riley	Associated Electric Cooperative, Inc.	Member	N	Y
Katherine Street	NERC	NERC Staff		Y
Mat Bunch	NERC	NERC Staff		Y
Shamai Elstein	NERC	NERC Staff		
Tom Hofstetter	NERC	NERC Staff		
Tobias Whitney	NERC	NERC Staff		
Mike Keane	FERC	FERC Staff		
Dave Norton	FERC	FERC Staff		

Matt Dale	FERC	FERC Staff		
Margaret Scott	FERC	FERC Staff		
Jan Bargen	FERC	FERC Staff		Y
Vincent Le	FERC	FERC Staff		Y
Ken Lanehome	Bonneville Power Administration	PMOS		
Ash Mayfield	Grand River Dam Authority	PMOS		

December 7, 2017
Question:
Should we continue to explore removing 'monitoring' from EACMS?

Attachment 1				
Name	**Company**	**Member/ Observer**	**Straw Vote (Y/N)**	**Conference Call/Web (Y/N)**
Christine Hasha	Electric Reliability Council of Texas	Co-Chair	Y	Y
David Revill	Georgia System Operations Corporation	Co-Chair		N
Steven Brain	Dominion Energy	Member	Y	Y
Jay Cribb	Southern Company	Member	Y	Y
Jennifer Flandermeyer	Kansas City Power and Light	Member	Y	Y
Tom Foster	PJM Interconnection	Member		Y
Richard Kinas	Orlando Utilities Commission	Member		Y
Forrest Krigbaum	Bonneville Power Administration	Member	Y	Y
Philippe Labrosse	Hydro-Quebec TransEnergie	Member	Y	Y
Mark Riley	Associated Electric Cooperative, Inc.	Member	Y	Y
Katherine Street	NERC	NERC Staff		Y
Mat Bunch	NERC	NERC Staff		Y
Shamai Elstein	NERC	NERC Staff		
Tom Hofstetter	NERC	NERC Staff		

Attachment 1				
Name	**Company**	**Member/ Observer**	**Straw Vote (Y/N)**	**Conference Call/Web (Y/N)**
Tobias Whitney	NERC	NERC Staff		Y
Mike Keane	FERC	FERC Staff		
Dave Norton	FERC	FERC Staff		Y
Matt Dale	FERC	FERC Staff		
Margaret Scott	FERC	FERC Staff		
Jan Bargen	FERC	FERC Staff		Y
Vincent Le	FERC	FERC Staff		Y
Ken Lanehome	Bonneville Power Administration	PMOS		
Ash Mayfield	Grand River Dam Authority	PMOS		